

#### Labor Market and Education for Artists and the Creative **Industries**

#### **Some Descriptive Results from Denmark**

Bille, Trine

Document Version Final published version

Publication date: 2009

License CC BY-NC-ND

Citation for published version (APA):
Bille, T. (2009). Labor Market and Education for Artists and the Creative Industries: Some Descriptive Results from Denmark. imagine.. CBS. Creative Encounters Working Paper No. 17

Link to publication in CBS Research Portal

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us (research.lib@cbs.dk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Download date: 04. Jul. 2025











# CREATIVE ENCOUNTERS

Creativity at Work:

A later version of this working paper has been published as:

Bille, Trine (2012): Creative labor: Who are they? What do they do? Where do they work? A discussion based on a quantitative study from Denmark, In: Christopher John Mathieu (ed.): *Careers in the creative industries*, Routhledge, pp 36 - 65

# Labor market and education for artists and the creative industries - some descriptive results from Denmark

By: Trine Bille

November 2008



## **Abstract**

The purpose of this paper is to analyze the labor market for artists and in the creative industries more broadly: How important is a formal education for jobs in the creative industries? How are the careers of people with a creative education? Do they work in the creative industries or outside the creative industries? How is the profile of the jobs within the creative industries?

Alper and Wassall (2006) present an overview of the economic, mainly empirical research concerning the labor market of artists. Different types of studies can be distinguished: theoretical models of artistic career processes, qualitative interviews and data, retrospective surveys and panel data based on surveys (either true panel studies or quasi panel studies).

Some of the most extended studies on artists' earnings are done by Alper and Wassall on American census data, where data comes from peoples self-reporting in surveys, and peoples' occupation is based on time spent at work during a single reference week. This do obvious have some drawbacks. Register data from Statistics Denmark representing true panel data, makes it possible to overcome some of these problems and gain new knowledge on the career patterns of artists, their income, the importance of education, multiple jobholding etc. The register data used in this paper includes a lot of variables on socio-economy, income, employment etc. for the Danish population in the period 1994-2003. The paper includes a discussion and delimitation of artist and the creative industries, and presents new empirical results on the labor market for artists and in the creative industries

# Keyword

## Author

Trine Bille is Associate professor in the Department of Department of Innovation and Organizational Economics, Copenhagen Business School, Kilevej 14A, DK-2000 Frederiksberg, Danmark. E-mail: <a href="mailto:tb.ino@cbs.dk">tb.ino@cbs.dk</a>.

## 1. Purpose

The purpose of this paper is to analyze the labor market for artists and in the creative industries more broadly: How important is a formal education for jobs in the creative industries? How are the careers of people with a creative education? Do they work in the creative industries or outside the creative industries? How is the profile of the jobs within the creative industries?

## 2. Background

Many studies have been done on artists labor market both from a theoretical and empirical point of view.

Alper and Wassall (2006) presents an overview of the empirical research done on artists labor market, where the overall purpose have been to get knowledge of artists employment and income conditions and compare them with other professionals and technical occupations. The research questions that have been analyzed in these studies include:

- 1) As working professionals, to what extent have artists fared less well than comparably educated persons in other disciplines?
- 2) Has the often reported disparity in earnings between artists and comparably educated groups grown or shrunk over time?
- 3) Is this apparent "earnings penalty" due to the characteristics inherent in the nature of the artistic labor market?
- 4) The decision process of those artists who routinely moonlight, both inside and outside the artistic profession.

Different methodologies have been used:

- a) Quantitative studies: Studies utilizing existing information on a group of artists obtained from a variety of sources to develop an understanding of an aspect of artist's careers. Sometimes the data for this research is anecdotal.
- b) Retrospective studies: Surveying artists and asking them to recreate their careers by responding to written questionnaires or personal interviews.
- c) Panel data based on surveys: Two types: "Quasi-panels" where they follow a group of artists, many of whom are likely to be the same from survey to survey over time, but exactly the same group of people/artists are not followed from the start to the end of a multiyear period, like it would be the case in true panel studies.

Alper and Wassall's own studies are some of the most extended empirical studies on artist's employment and earning conditions. They have based their studies on US census data, which obvious have some drawbacks. The Census requires that a person filling out its long form choose a single occupation. This

## (C) REATIVE ENCOUNTERS

choice is based on time spent at work during a single reference week. This means that:

- Census definitions result in a bias toward including only those who achieve the most success in their art form as artists
- Many artists do also hold non-artistic jobs, i.e. they are multiple job holders. This aspect cannot be studied using census data.

The main results concluding Alper and Wassall's studies are as following:

- Artists are found to work fewer hours, suffer higher unemployment and earn less than members of the reference group.
- Disparities in unemployment and annual hours worked are found to shrink somewhat over time, but disparities in earnings do not.
- Artist earned less across all years even when only members working full-time year-round of each group are compared.
- The earnings of artists are found to display greater variability than those of other professional and technical workers
- Many people participate in the artistic labor market, but that few succeed to the point that enables them to develop a career in the arts
- In part due to their relatively high educational levels, artists are found to be able to transition from forays into arts occupations or jobs in professional and managerial occupations, not into service occupations as artists "mythology" might suggest
- When artists are young and struggling to make it they do work in various service occupations that tend to provide greater work schedule flexibility.
- Many people explore the arts as an occupation but very few remain as artists for significant periods of time.

According to Alper and Wassall (2006) the most striking findings are related to the consistently poorer labor market outcomes of artists. Given that these labor market disparities persists across seven census years, any type of disequilibrium is unlikely to be the cause. Over a sixty years period, one would normally expect any disequilibrium to have adjusted. This leads to search for alternative explanations. Alper and Wassall summarize several hypotheses that have been advanced to explain what makes the artist labor market unique:

- 1) Throsby's (1994) "work preference" model of artist behavior, which postulates that the artist is driven to create, and will maximize time spent working as an artist subject to constraints of earning sufficient income, form either inside or outside the arts, to finance an acceptable level of consumption.
- 2) Another set of theories lies in the roles of risk-taking among artists and the rewards to those who rise to the top of their profession. Although these theories were mainly used to explain income distributions among artists, they also have implications for labor supply.

3) A related theory is found in the literature on the earning of superstars (Rosen, 1981, Adler, 2006) and "winner-take-all-markets".

Towse (2006) discuss the human capital theory and argues that it applies only weakly to artist's decisions about investment in schooling and training and about occupational choice. The same can be said about the sorting model. What is lacking in cultural economics is according to Towse (2006) an understanding of talent and creativity, which economic factors motivate artists and how creativity can be encouraged as part of government cultural policy. Bringing social and cultural capital into the equation do not seem to add much in the way of understanding artist's labor markets.

The impact of education on artist's earnings has been subject to different studies. Earning functions can be used to explore possible differences in the rewards to education, training and other labor market attributes between artists and a reference group. Results shows that artists do not seem to fit the standard earnings model as well as other workers, and earnings functions for them have poorer goodness-of-fit. Also results shows no or a negative correlation of education with artistic earnings and a positive correlation with non-artistic earnings. Rengers (2002) found that characteristics of the artist's education were to have little or no impact on the artist's career. Self-educated artists have the same earnings and the same supply behavior as those with formal arts education and the prestige of the arts college attended does not have long-lasting effects. However, Filer (1989) found, looking at three-digit occupations, that measures of earnings inequality "for occupations where individual talent and performance are important determinants of earnings tend to be similar to those for artists" (p. 74), making the arts similar to "equal" occupations.

Rengers (2002) was interested in determining the best model to explain artistic careers. He compared the traditional human capital model, in which the artists' career are affected by their intrinsic and learned qualities, to the winner-take-all model, in which the relative differences among artists are the most significant factor in explaining the differences in careers. Rengers' results provide mixed support for both models.

Alper and Wassall (2006) are pointing out suggestions for research questions for future research:

- Does the greater amount of multiple job-holding by artists, both inside and outside their artistic occupation, explain some or all the observed differences in annual hours worked and unemployment rates?
- To what extent does holding jobs outside the artistic profession reduce risk and thus earnings inequality as well as supplement earnings?
- What triggers the artists' decision to leave the arts for good?

• How does the allocation of an artist's time to various income generation activities change over his/her career?

And they ends up concluding: "The information collected is not tailored to unearth information about the unique labor market activities of many artists, especially their multiple jobholding behavior, sources of earnings, allocation of time and costs of producing their art. While a great deal has been learned, there is a great deal more to learn." (Alper and Wassall, 2006).

## 3. Data

It is interesting to notice that none of the empirical studies mentioned by Alper and Wassall (2006) are based on real panel data. In this paper real panel data are used for the analyses. The data used in this paper are register data for the total Danish population for the period 1994-2003. That is real panel data, meaning that each person (in anonymous form) can be traced over time. The register contains, among other things, detailed information about the persons socio-economy (age, gender, family, education etc.), income (annual personal income, households income, earnings per hour etc.), employment (industry, job function, primary job, secondary job, degree of unemployment etc.) as well as many other variables.

# 4. Definitions and delimitation of artists and creative industries

To analyze the labor market for artists and the creative industries, this population must be defined and delimitated. There can be different approaches to this, and there is no a priori right definition (Bille and Lorenzen, 2008). Therefore, it is important to bear in mind, that the results can be quite dependent on the definitions and approaches used.

Alper and Wassall (2006) takes a broad definition and includes e.g. teachers and announcers: 1) Actors and directors, 2) announcers, 3) architects, 4) post-secondary art, drama and music teachers, 5) authors, 6) dancers, 7) designers, 8) musicians and composers, 9) painters, sculptors, craft artists and printmakers, 10) photographers and 11) artists not elsewhere classified. In their study they uses census data, meaning that they are defining artists as those people working in one of these occupations in the selected reference week. This do obvious has some drawbacks as mentioned above.

Another very common approach is to select the research population on the basis of members of selected labor market organization for selected groups of

artists, like The Danish Association of Visual Artists and the Danish Musicians' Union (e.g. Elstad and Pedersen, 1996 and Heian, Løyland and Mangset, 2008), and collect data by means of surveys. On problem with this approach is that it will only create knowledge of those artists who are members of such an organization. If most artists are members of these kinds of organizations and the degree of organization is high, the problem will be small. But we do not know very much about the degree of organization among artists and different groups of artists, and how it has changed during time.

In this paper the definition of artists and creative industries are done on the basis of the possibilities in the register data from Statistics Denmark.

The first step has been to select the areas of creative content, which should be included in the study. The following areas are included: performing arts, music, film, media, architecture, design, visual arts and crafts, advertising and photography. Because the idea is to look at *artists* and *creative* industries the choice is made only to include those areas, which have a *production with artistic creativity as the main input in the production process, with an art product or a creative product as the main output*.

Using register data from Statistics Denmark to look at artists and creative industries, three different criteria can be used for delimitation:

- 1) Creative industries
- 2) Creative job content
- 3) Creative education

#### Ad. 1) Creative industries

There is no universal or general accepted definition of creative industries. As Throsby (2007) points out different delimitations has been use in different studies, primarily depending on the purpose of the studies. In this paper the following industries (based on 4 digit NACE-codes) has been selected (see further appendix A): Independent artists, performing arts, music, film, media, architecture and design, advertising, photography and crafts. Because the idea is to look at *artists* and *creative* industries the choice is made only to include those areas, which have a production with artistic creativity as the main input in the production process, with an arts product or a creative product as the main output. This delimitation is only possible to a certain degree, but it implies for instance that publishing, but also museums and libraries as well as distribution, sale of arts and creative products etc. in general are not included in the analyses. This is a very narrow definition, compared to other definitions of creative industries (se e.g. Throsby, 2007 and Bille and Lorenzen, 2008), but it is chosen to make the focus as sharp as possible on the labor market conditions for artistic creativity and production.

#### Ad. 2) Creative job content

Looking at the labor marked for the selected creative industries, we will find people working there with a creative job content, and people working with "ordinary" job functions, like office work, technical support etc.: humdrum functions (Caves, 2000). By means of the register data it is possible to select a range of job functions, which are creative (see appendix B). These creative job functions can be found within the creative industries as well as in other industries.

#### Ad. 3) Creative education

Finally, it is possible to select people with "an artistic or creative education". The first problem is to make the selection of the relevant educations as the basis for the analysis. The educations should be within the areas selected above, and the education should lead to skills for *production* of creative content within these areas. But in practice there are a lot of borderline cases and "grey" areas. For instance there are a lot of short-term educations and labor market educations and courses within the creative industries more broadly, especially concerning the media and technical skills. These are not included. Besides educations for the protection and dissemination of cultural heritage, like library schools, museum conservator educations etc. are not included. And there is a lot of master degrees in humanities at university level, which are directed at knowledge and interpretation of creative work of arts, but not the production of creative content. Neither these educations are included. A list of educations included in the study is available in appendix C.

A problem by focusing on those persons with "an artistic or creative education" could be that many artists or people working with creative content do not have a formal education that qualifies to this work. Many artists are self-taught (Alper and Wassall, 2006). By only looking at persons with some kind of artistic or creative education, one delimit the group of artists and other creative people, who are doing the same kind of creative work, but who do not have a formal education.

Bearing this in mind, it is however, an interesting empirical question, to focus on those persons who have an artistic or creative education and see how they are doing. In which industries do they work, which job functions do they occupy, what are their degree of unemployment, their income and wages etc. – and compare it with others at the same educational level.

Besides, the idea behind this paper is to look at all three criteria for delimitation of artists and creative industries: 1) industries, 2) creative job functions and 3) creative educations. This makes it possible to get a more holistic picture of the creative job marked, and answer questions like:

- The creative industries: Of the total employment in these industries how many have a creative job content, and how many have an artistic or creative education?
- Creative job content: How large a share of the jobs with a creative job function is within the creative industries? How large a share of those with a creative job content, do have an artistic or creative education?

 Artistic or creative education: How large a share of those with a creative education work within the creative industries? And how large a share of those with a creative education, have a creative job content?

For the different groups it will also be possible to look at their age, gender, job mobility, unemployment rates etc. And maybe of most interest: to look at their income from primary as well as secondary jobs. It will also be possible to take the analyses a step further to estimate wage elasticities for different groups.

Looking at employment and income conditions for artists and people working within the creative industries, we need in most cases a reference population. As Alper and Wassall (2006) observes: "Most Census-based studies have compared artists' labor market outcomes to a reference population. The choice of reference population has not been consistent, ranging from specific occupations with comparable educational attainment to specific professional occupations, to all workers, and to all managerial, professional and technical workers." In this paper the reference population is the total work force in Denmark. But in some cases, only the persons with an education on similar level are chosen as the reference population.

## 5. Descriptive results

In this section some descriptive results will be presented concerning the creative labor market, looking at it from the three perspectives: creative industries, creative job functions and creative educations.<sup>1</sup>

#### 5.1 Creative industries

In Denmark a total number of 34,405 persons are working in the creative industries, as they are defined here. 76 percent are employed full time, 7 percent are employed part time and 17 percent are self-employed. But there are variations between industries, with only 26 percent of the independent artists being employed full time, 49 percent among photographers and 55 percent in the music industry.

The largest number of jobs in the creative industries is found in architecture and design, advertising and the media. The smallest number of jobs is found in music, independent artists and craft.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Project assistant Peter Bildtoft has done the data work for this paper. Page 9 of 26 Creative Encou7nters Working Paper # 17

Table 1. Number of employed in the creative industries, full time, part time and self-employed. Denmark, 2003.

	Industry									
	Architec-				Indepen-					
Employ-	ture &	Мо-	Photo-		dent			Perform-	Adver-	
ment	design	vies	graphers	Craft	artists	Media	Music	ing arts	tising	Total
Full time	6425	2017	838	710	229	5744	166	4079	5988	26196
Part time	417	278	79	26	110	340	33	610	412	2305
Self-										
employed	2140	499	766	214	540	206	98	324	1117	5904
Total	8982	2794	1683	950	879	6290	297	5013	7517	34405

Table 2 shows the proportion of the employed in the creative industries, who have a creative job function. On average 36 percent of those working in the creative industries have a creative job function, 41 percent have other (humdrum) job functions and 23 percent have unknown job functions. Again there are variations among the industries, where the largest part of creative jobs is found among the independent artists (83 percent), photographers (61 percent) and architecture and design (56 percent). Media (24 percent) and advertising (27 percent) have the lowest number of creative job functions.

Table 2. Proportion of the employed in the creative industries with a creative job function. Denmark, 2003.

	Industry									
	Architec-				Indepen-					
Job-	ture &		Photo-		dent			Perform-	Adver-	
function	design	Movies	graphers	Craft	artists	Media	Music	ing arts	tising	Total
Creative	56	46	61	48	83	24	53	37	27	36
Other	28	28	13	40	7	39	31	44	48	41
Un-										
known	16	26	26	12	10	37	16	19	25	23
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

Table 3 shows that among those people working in the creative industries, 20 percent have a creative education. The largest part (55 percent) has a very short education (most of them do only have graduation from ground school or high school), 13 percent have a non-creative medium-cycle higher education and 6 percent have a non-creative long-cycle higher education.

Again there are variations among industries, with the largest share of those working in architecture and design having a creative education (37 percent). 29 percent of the photographers have a creative education, and about 20 percent of the independent artists, performing arts and the media.

The largest part of persons with a very short educational background is found in crafts (83 percent), music (69 percent), movies (67 percent) and advertising (66 percent). The lowest share is found in architecture and design, where 33 percent have a short education.

## CREATIVE ENCOUNTERS

*Table 3. Proportion of the employed in the creative industries with a creative education and other kinds of educations. Denmark, 2003.* 

	Industry									
	,									
	Architec-				Indepen-			_		
			Photo-		dent			Performi	Advertis	
Education	design	vies	graphers	Craft	artists	Media	Music	ng arts	ing	Total
Creative	37	11	29	5	20	19	6	19	4	20
Short	33	67	58	83	54	59	69	62	66	55
Short-										
cycle										
higher										
edu.	5	4	2	3	4	4	6	2	7	4
Medium-										
cycle										
higher										
edu.	22	9	6	5	13	9	12	8	12	13
Long-										
cycle										
higher										
edu.	2	7	2	2	7	7	6	4	10	6
No or Un-										
known	2	2	2	2	3	1	1	4	1	2
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

The distribution on gender and age of those people working in the creative industries shows that there are more men than women. 59 percent are men and 41 percent are women. Most men are found in the music industry, among photographers and in the movie industry and in architecture and design. Most women are found in crafts, advertising and among independent artists. Most women working in the creative industries are between 26 and 45 years old, and most men are between 26 and 55 years old.

Table 4. Employed in the creative industries, distributed on age and gender. Denmark, 2003.

2000.											
		Industr									
		y									
		Archi-									
		tecture		Photo-		Inde-			Perfor-		
		&		grapher		pendent			ming	Adver-	
Gender	Age	design	Movies	s	Crafts	artists	Media	Music	arts	tising	Total
Women	16-25	3	3	4	4	3	3	2	5	5	4
	26-35	12	16	10	15	8	14	10	12	20	14
	36-45	13	11	9	11	13	12	8	11	12	12
	46-55	7	4	5	11	11	7	2	9	5	7
	56-66	4	2	5	7	8	5	1	5	3	4
Women											
Total		39	36	33	48	43	42	23	42	45	41
Men	16-25	2	8	4	3	3	4	8	6	5	4
	26-35	17	26	19	9	14	18	31	15	20	18
	36-45	16	19	19	12	15	16	19	15	15	16
	46-55	15	8	15	12	13	12	12	13	9	12

	56-66	12	4	10	16	11	9	6	8	6	9
Men											
Total		61	64	67	52	57	58	77	58	55	59
Total		100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

## 5.2 Creative job functions

A total number of 41,921 persons in Denmark have a creative job function, as it is defined in this paper. Of these people 1/3 is working in the creative industries. The rest is working in other industries. The variation among the creative job functions shows that most of the creative job functions are found in architecture, craft and design and media.

Besides, among the creative job functions within performing arts, music and movies the largest shares of the jobs are within the creative industries: 80 percent of the creative jobs in performing arts are within the creative industries, 76 percent of the creative jobs in music are within the creative industries and 71 percent of the creative jobs in movies are within the creative industries. On the other hand only 20 percent of the creative job functions within architecture are found within the creative industries. The rest of the creative job functions within architecture are in other industries. The same applies to craft and design, where 28 percent of the creative job functions are within the creative industries, and media, were 30 percent of the creative jobs are within the creative industries. This means than 70 percent of the jobs dealing with media in a creative way are in other industries.

Table 5. Number of persons with a creative job function, working in the creative industries and other industries. Denmark, 2003.

	Architectu			Craft &			Performin	
Industry	re	Visual arts	Movies	design	Media	Music	g arts	Total
Creative	3349	1696	2783	2374	2429	680	760	14071
Other	13395	1482	1108	5984	5482	210	189	27850
Total	16744	3178	3891	8358	7911	890	949	41921

Table 6 shows the number of people with a creative job function outside the creative industries. Most of these jobs are in manufacturing – and these jobs are dealing with either media, craft and design or architecture. Within manufacturing the jobs are mainly in industries like graphic industry, publishing and printing, manufacture of furniture and clothing.

There are also a number of creative jobs within public and private services. These jobs are related to architecture or to a smaller extent media. Within public and private services most jobs are in industries dealing with public services and administration.

Financial intermediation and business activity do also hold a number of creative jobs – again mainly within architecture. Within financial intermediation

and business activity most jobs are in industries like technical support and analysis.

And finally, wholesale and retail trade, hotels and restaurants have some creative jobs, mainly with a job function related to craft and design.

Table 6. Number of persons with a creative job function, who are not working in the creative industries, distributed on other industries. Denmark, 2003.

	Architectu			Craft &			Performin	
	re	Visual arts	Movies	design	Media	Music	g arts	Total
Constructi								
on	738	1	4	31	9	0	8	791
Electricity,								
gas and								
water	430	0	2	5	16	0	1	454
Financial								
intermedia								
-tion,								
business								
activity	4204	582	146	225	292	2	32	5483
Wholesale								
and retail								
trade;								
hotels								
restaurants	312	376	83	2165	94	8	46	3084
Manufac-								
turing	2856	419	311	3326	3550	5	5	10472
Agricultur								
e fishing								
and								
quarrying	12	0	1	8	0	0	0	21
Public and								
private								
services	4582	95	528	151	1416	194	85	7051
Transport,								
storage								
and								
communi-		_			- A -	_		
cation	261	9	33	72	105	1	12	493
Activity	_	_	_		_	_	_	
not stated	0		0	1	0		0	
Total	13395	1482	1108	5984	5482	210	189	27850

Table 7 shows the number of persons with a creative job function, which have a creative education. In total 22 percent of the persons with a creative job function has a creative education. The share is highest in the music industry, where 57 percent of those with a creative job function have a creative education. In visual arts it is only 9 percent.

*Table 7. Number of persons with a creative job function, with a creative education or other kinds of educations/no educations. Denmark, 2003.* 

		Visual		Craft &			Performing	
Education	Architecture	arts	Movies	design	Media	Music	arts	Total
Creative	3589	272	745	977	2992	510	340	9425
Non creative	13155	2906	3146	7381	4919	380	609	32496
Total	16744	3178	3891	8358	7911	890	949	41921

Table 8 shows which kind of education those have, who have a creative job function but not a creative education. About half of them have a short education. About 30 percent have a medium-cycle higher education and 15 percent have a long-cycle higher education. Of those with a short education many do not have further education than ground school or high school. Some people have some kind of technical education or a short graphic education, or an education within commerce or office work. Of those with a non-creative higher education most have a technical education or a language education.

Table 8. Number of persons with a creative job function, who do not have a creative education. Distributed on other kind of educations or no education. Denmark, 2003.

	Architectu			Craft &			Performin	
Education	re	Visual art	Movies	design	Media	Music	g arts	Total
Short	1610	2205	2582	6173	2787	243	445	16045
Short-cycle								
higher								
edu.	617	141	108	357	183	10	12	1428
Medium-								
cycle								
higher								
edu.	7352	352	243	543	863	49	45	9447
Long-cycle higher								
edu.	3337	152	133	90	989	29	22	4752
No or								
unknown	239	56	80	218	97	49	85	824
Total	13155	2906	3146	7381	4919	380	609	32496

## 5.3 Artistic or creative educations

27,936 persons in Denmark have a creative education as it is defined in this paper, and about half of them educated within visual arts and architecture. 33 percent is educated within movies and media, and 14 percent within music. Only a minor proportion is educated within the performing arts.

Of those with a creative education 25 percent are working within the creative industries, about half of them are working outside the creative industries and 25 percent are somehow outside industries. The largest share of those who have an education within the performing arts works within the

creative industries (50 percent), and only 18 percent of those with an education within music works within the creative industries.

*Table 9. Number of persons with a creative education distributed on creative industries, other industries and outside industries. Denmark, 2003.* 

	Education				
		Visual arts &			
Industry	Movies & media	architecture	Music	Performing arts	Total
Others	5163	6437	2514	185	14299
Creative	1902	3834	696	408	6840
Outside					
industries	2028	3708	767	294	6797
Total	9093	13979	3977	887	27936

Of the persons with a creative education who are not working in the creative industries, most people are working in public and private services (48 percent). But also manufacturing (23 percent) and financial intermediation and business activity (12 percent) employ a substantial proportion of the persons with a creative education who works outside the creative industries.

Those with an education in movies and media do mostly work in manufacturing (mainly publishing, printing and newspapers) but also to some degree in public and private services (IT-services and support). Those with an education in visual arts and architecture do mostly work in public and private services and to a lesser extent in financial intermediation and business activity (IT-services etc.). Persons educated in the performing arts (and not working in the creative industries) do mostly work in public and private services.

Table 10. Number of persons with a creative education, who are working in other industries than the creative industries. Distributed on industries. Denmark, 2003.

	Education				
	Movies and	Visual arts &			
Industry	media	architecture	Music	Performing arts	Total
Construction	18	145	6	1	170
Electricity, gas					
and water					
supply	10	13	2	0	25
Financial					
intermediation,					
business activity	502	1047	86	20	1655
Wholesale and					
retail trade;					
hotels,					
restaurants	304	760	46	8	1118
Manufacturing	2458	805	36	7	3306
Agriculture,					
fishing and					
quarrying	18	42	7	1	68
Public and					
private services	1508	3003	2241	107	6859
Transport,	145	222	20	8	395

storage and communication					
Activity not					
stated	200	400	70	33	703
Total	5163	6437	2514	185	14299

Of the persons with a creative education 35 percent have a creative job function, 35 percent have other job functions (humdrum) and for 30 percent their job functions are unknown. It is especially those with an education in music who have other job functions than creative; only 16 percent of those with an education in music has a creative job function.

*Table 11. Number of persons with a creative education, distributed on creative job functions and other job functions. Denmark, 2003.* 

	Education				
		Visual arts and			
Job function	Movies & media	architecture	Music	Performing arts	Total
Other	2010	4934	2417	176	9537
Creative	3618	5198	642	377	9835
Unknown	3465	3847	918	334	8564
Total	9093	13979	3977	887	27936

Of those people with a creative education who have non-creative job function, most people are working as professionals (45 percent), and this is mainly teaching. 17 percent are working as technicians and associate professionals, and 10 percent are working as service workers, shop and market sales workers. Of those with an education in movies and media many are also working as legislators, senior officials and managers (12 percent) and clerks (20 percent). With an education in visual arts and architecture a total of 60 percent are working as professionals or technical and associate professionals. With an education in music 81 percent are working as professionals and while 40 percent of those with an education in the performing arts are working as professionals.

Table 12. Number of persons with a creative education, who do not have a creative job function, distributed on other job functions. Denmark, 2003.

	Education				
				Perfor-	
	Movies &	Visual arts &		ming	
Job function	media	architecture	Music	arts	Total
Armed forces	25		63	0	90
Legislators, senior officials and					
managers	248	376	18	11	653
Professionals	453	1831	1969	72	4325
Technicians and associate					
professionals	337	1119	104	25	1585
Clerks	393	388	94	23	898
Service workers; shop and market					
sales workers	272	584	102	32	990
Skilled agricultural and fishery	12	26	5 4	1	43

## CREATIVE ENCOUNTERS

workes					
Crafts and related trades workers	65	191	19	2	277
Plant and machine operators and					
assemblers	60	110	5	2	177
Elementary occupations	145	307	39	8	499
Total	2010	4934	2417	176	9537

Table 13 shows the degree of unemployment for persons with a creative education. 75 percent of those people are full time employed compared to 85 percent for all other educations (table 14). With an education within the performing arts less than 50 percent are working full time.

*Table 13. Degree of unemployment for persons with a creative education. Denmark, 2003.* 

Degree of un- employment	Movies & media	Visual arts & architecture	Music	Performing arts	Total
Full-time	media	architecture	Widsic	urts	10tai
employed	78,1	75,3	74,2	46,7	75,2
	70,1	15,5	74,2	40,7	13,2
0-25%					
unemployment	7,8	8,7	10,0	15,7	8,8
25-50%					
unemployment	5,4	5,9	8,3	19,2	6,5
50-75%					
unemployment	4,6	5,5	5,8	13,0	5,5
75-100%					
unemployment	3,7	4,1	1,7	5,4	3,7
Full					
unemployed	0,4	0,4	0,0	0,1	0,4
Total	100	100	100	100	100

Table 14. Degree of unemployment for all other educations. Denmark, 2003.

Degree of unemploym ent	No or unknown	Short	Short-cycle higher edu.	Medium- cycle higher edu.	Long-cycle higher edu.	Total
Full-time	unknown	Short	inglici cau.	cau.	inglici caa.	Total
employed	87,2	83,6	84,6	87,8	87,3	84,5
	07,2	63,0	04,0	07,0	67,3	04,3
0-25%						
unemploym		0.0	0.4	_ ,		0.5
ent	6,5	8,9	8,1	7,4	6,4	8,5
25-50%						
unemploym						
ent	3,1	3,7	3,5	2,4	2,8	3,5
50-75%						
unemploym						
ent	1,8	2,1	2,2	1,5	2,0	2,0
75-100%						
unemploym						
ent	1,0	1,3	1,4	0,9	1,3	1,3
Full		-	-	-	-	
unemploym						
ent	0,3	0,3	0,2	0,1	0,2	0,2
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100

Table 15 shows likewise, that the number of employment affiliations are larges within the performing arts and music, with about 50 percent having more than 2 employment affiliations within 2003, indicating a huge job mobility and short part time jobs.

*Table 15. The number of employment affiliations for persons with a creative education. Denmark, 2003.* 

	Ecucation				
Number of					
employment		Visual arts			
affiliations	Movies &	and		Performing	
within 2003	media	architecture	Music	arts	Total
1	61,8	56,0	29,5	29,0	53,2
2	26,4	32,4	23,1	20,0	28,7
>2	11,8	11,6	47,3	51,0	18,0
Total	100	100	100	100	100

*Table 16. The number of employment affiliations for persons with all other educations. Denmark, 2003.* 

	Education				
Number of					
employment					
affiliations	No or		Short-cycle	Medium-cycle	Long-cycle
within 2003	unknown	Short	higher edu.	higher edu.	higher edu.
1	91,2	67,1	66,9	65,6	58,6
2	6,9	23,2	25,1	24,2	27,4
>2	1,9	9,7	8,0	10,2	14,0
Total	100	100	100	100	100

## 6. Conclusion

In this paper the creative job marked have been delimitated and analyzed from three different perspectives: creative industries, creative job content and creative education. A quite narrow definition has been used in all three perspectives focusing on the production of culture and creative content, making the conclusions as sharp as possible on labor market conditions for artistic creativity and production. The descriptive results presented here, shows some interesting results:

#### Creative industries:

- 34,405 persons are working in the creative industries in Danmark (2003) as they are defined in this paper. This can be compared to a total work force in Denmark of 2,766,296 persons (2003).
- 36 percent of these people have a creative job content, 41 percent having other (humdrum) job functions, and 23 percent have unknown job functions.

• 20 percent of these people working in the creative industries have a creative education, and the largest part (55 percent) have a very short education (only ground-school, high-school or the like).

#### Creative job functions:

- 41,921 persons in Denmark have a creative job function, as it is defined in this paper (2003).
- 1/3 of these people are working in the creative industries. The rest is working in other industries, mainly in manufacturing, public and private services and financial intermediation and business activity.
- 22 percent of the persons with a creative job function has a creative education, 38 percent have a very short education.

#### Creative educations:

- 27,936 persons in Denmark have a creative education as it is defined in this paper.
- 25 percent of these people are working in the creative industries and about 50 percent are working outside the creative industries, and 25% are somehow outside industries.
- 35 percent of the persons with a creative education, have a creative job function, 35 percent have other job functions (humdrum) and for 30 percent their job function are unknown.

Besides, the analyses have shown a lot of variation between different creative industries, different kinds of creative job content and different kinds of creative education.

In total these numbers can show us that there are a huge amount of noncreative jobs in the creative industries and many of the persons working in these industries do only have a very short education.

The creative workers can be defined either by creative job content or by education. Defined in this way the analysis shows that most of the creative people are working in other industries than the creative industries. Both in terms of job content and in terms of creative education most creative people and jobs are in other industries than the creative industries. The creative economy is much more broad than the creative industries, and creativity are hugely spread to other industries – represented by between 50 – 67 percent of the artists and creative people working outside the creative industries.

This paper has mainly been looking at the delimitation of artists and creative industries, and has shown some descriptive results based on industries, job content and education. The data from Statistics Denmark used in this paper makes it, however, possible to do much further research on the labor market conditions for artists and in the creative industries. Questions like job mobility, inflow and outflow in different industries, and especially income conditions for the different groups of the creative economy defined in this paper, will be the subject for further research, and based on these data it will be possible to

## CREATIVE ENCOUNTERS

answer more of the questions raised in the introduction of this paper. Selecting the "right" group of artists and creative working people is a big challenge. But having selected a group of artists or creative workers, it will further be possible to estimate wage elasticities and in this way to look at the importance of wage for the supply of labor for different groups in the creative economy.

## References

Abbing, H. (2002): Why are Artists Poor? The Exceptional Economy of the Arts. Amterdam University Press, Amsterdam.

Adler, Moshe (2006): Stardom and Talent, In: Victor A. Ginsburgh and David Thorsby (ed.): Handbook of the Economics of Arts and Culture, Series: Handbook of Economics 25, North-Holland

Alper, Neil O. and Gregory H. Wassall (2006): Artist's Careers and Their Labor Markets, In: Victor A. Ginsburgh and David Thorsby (ed.): Handbook of the Economics of Arts and Culture, Series: Handbook of Economics 25, North-Holland

Bille, Trine and Mark Lorenzen (2008): Den danske oplevelsesøkonomi – afgrænsning, økonomisk betydning og vækstmuligheder, Forlaget Samfundslitteratur, Copenhagen

Caves, R. (2000): Economics of the Creative Industries, Harvard University Press, Cambridge MA.

Elstad, Jon Iver and K.R. Pedersen (1996): Kunstnernes økonomiske vilkår, Rapport fra Inntekts- og yrkesundersøkelsen brandt kunstnere 1993-94, INAS rapport, Institut for Socialforskning, Oslo.

Filer, R.K. (1989): The economic condition of artists in America, In: Shaw, D.V. et al (Eds.): Cultural Economis 88: An American Perspective, Association for Cultural Economics, Akron.

Heian, Mari Torvik, Knut Løyland and Per Mangset (2008): Kunstnernes aktivitet, arbeids- og inntektsforhold, 2006, Rapport nr. 241, Telemarksforskning-Bø

Rengers, M. (2002): Economic Lives of Artists; Studies intor Careers and the Labour Market in the Cultural Sector, Utrecht University, Interuniversity Center for Social Science Theory and Methodology, Utrecht.

Rosen, S. (1981): The economics of superstars, American Economic Review 71, pp 845-858.

## © REATIVE ENCOUNTERS

Throsby, David (1994): A work-preference model of artist behaviour, In: Peacock, A. an I. Rizzo (Eds.): Cultural Economics and Cultural Policies, Kluwer Academic, Boston MA, pp 69-80.

Throsby, David (2007): Paper presented at the conference: "Cultural Industries Seminar Network: New Directions in Research: Substance, Method and Critique, Edinburgh January 2007.

Towse, Ruth (2006): Human Capital and Artists' Labor Markets, In: Victor A. Ginsburgh and David Thorsby (ed.): Handbook of the Economics of Arts and Culture, Series: Handbook of Economics 25, North-Holland

#### Appendix A. Creative Industries

Independent artists	92.31.20	Activities of induvidual artists
Performing arts	92.31.10	Live theatrical presentations,
		concerts and opera production
	92.32.00	Operation of arts facilities
Music	22.14.00	Publishing of sound recordings
Film	92.11.00	Motion picture and video
		production
Media	92.20.00	Radio and television activities
Architecture and design	74.20.40	Consulting architectural activities
	74.84.10	Activities of interior decorators
	74.84.20	Fashion design and industrial
		plant design
Advertising	74.40.10	Advertising
Photography	74.81.10	Photograpers
Craft	36.22.20	Workshops engaged in
		manufacture of gold and silver
		articles and jewellers

#### Appendix B. Creative job content

Visual arts	2452	Sculptures, painters and related
		artists
Performing arts	2454	Choreographers and dancers
	2455	Film, stage and related actors and
	3473	directors
		Street, night-club and related
	3474	musicians, singers and dancers
		Clowns, magicians, acrobats and
		related associate professionals
Music	2453	Composers, musicians and singers
Movies	3131	Photographers and image and
		sound recording equipment
	3139	operators
		Optical and electronic equipment
		operators not elsewhere classified
Media	2451	Authors, journalists and other
		writers
Architecture	2141	Architects, town and traffic
	2149	planners
		Architects, engineers and related
		professionals not elsewhere
		classified
Craft and design	3471	Decorators and commercial
	7313	designers
	7321	Jewellery and precious-metal
		workers
	7322	Abrasive wheel formers, potters
	7323	and related workers
	7324	Glass-makers, cutters, grinders
		and finishers
	7331	Glass engravers and etchers
		Glass, ceramics and related
	7332	decorative painters
		Handicraft workers in wood and
	7431	related materials
	7432	Handicraft workers in textile,

7433	leather and related materials
	Fibre preparers (handicraft)
7434	Weavers, knitters and related
7435	workers (handicraft)
	Tailors, dressmakers and hatters
7436	Furriers and related workers
	Textile, leather and related
7437	workers (handicraft)
	Sewers, embroiderers and related
	workers (handicraft)
	Upholsterers and related workers

## Appendix C. Creative education

Movies and media	Vocational education	355570	Photographer
	Short-cycle higher	402530	Multimediadesigner
	education	403060	Film
	Medium-cycle higher	502530	Journalist
	education	503060	Film
		602530	Communication, mass
		00000	media (BA)
	Long-cycle higher	652530	Communication, mass
	education	653050	media
			Visual art
Performing arts	Short-cycle higher	403040	Dramatic arts
8	education		
	Medium-cycle higher	503030	Dancer
	education		
Music	Short-cycle higher	403020	Music art
	education		
	Medium-cycle higher	503020	Academy of music
	education	603005	Folk music (BA)
		603010	Electronic music (BA)
		603015	Church music (BA)
		603020	Classical music (BA)
		603025	Music educations, the rest
		603030	(BA)
			Music, rhythmical (BA)
	Long-cycle higher	653005	Folk music
	education	653010	Electronic music
		653015	Church music
		653020	Classical music
		653025	Music educations, the rest
		653030	Rhythmnical music
		703020	Music education, ph.d.
Visual arts and	Short-cycle higher	403000	The arts general
architecture	education	403010	Arts and craft
		405985	Design technology
		405986	Design technology
	Medium-cycle higher	503000	The arts general
	education	503010	Arts and craft
		503050	Visual art
		505980	Graphic designer
		605965	Architect (BA)
	Long-cycle higher	653000	The arts general
	education	653050	Visual arts
		655965	Architect
		705900	Architect, ph.d.

#### www.cbs.dk/creativeencounters

## Working Papers List

#1	Making Scents of Smell:
	Manufacturing Incense in Japan

By: Brian Moeran June 2007

#### #2 From Participant Observation to Observant Participation: Anthropology, Fieldwork and Organizational Ethnography

By: Brian Moeran July 2007

#### #3 Creative Encounters in the Film Industry:

Content, Cost, Chance, and Collection

By: Mark Lorenzen August 2007

#### #4 Hvilke kulturtilbud bruger den kreative klasse?

By: Trine Bille August 2007

#### **#5** Chinese Tourists in Denmark

By: Can-Seng Ooi October 2007

## #6 Authenticity-in-Context: Embedding the Arts and Culture in Branding Berlin and Singapore

By: Can-Seng Ooi and Birgit Stöber January 2008

#### #7 Credibility of a Creative Image: The Singaporean Approach

By: Can-Seng Ooi January 2008

#### #8 On the Globalization of the Film Industry

By: Mark Lorenzen February 2008

#### #9 A methodology for studying design cognition in the real world

By: Bo Christensen February 2008

## #10 Embedded Structural Tensions in the Organization of Japanese Advertising Production

By: Brian Moeran February 2008

# #11 The simultaneous success and disappearance of Hong Kong martial arts film, analysed through costume and movement in 'Crouching Tiger, Hidden Dragon'

By: Lise Skov February 2008

#### #12 An Anthropological Analysis of Book Fairs

By: Brian Moeran September 2008

#### **#13** The Art of Selling Art

By: Nina Poulsen March 2008

## #14 Much Ado about Nothing? Untangling the Impact of European Premier Film Festivals

By: Jesper Strandgaard Pedersen September 2008

#### #15 Redefining luxury: A review essay

By: Fabian Faurholt Csaba November 2008

## #16 Who's Last? Challenges and Advantages for Late Adopters in the International Film Festival Field

By: Carmelo Mazza and Jesper Strandgaard Pedersen November 2008

## #17 Labor market and education for artists and the creative industries - some descriptive results from Denmark

By: Trine Bille November 2008